



АЛИШЕР НАВОИЙ ВА XXI АСР

Халқаро илмий-назарий анжуман
Тошкент, 2019 йил, 9 февраль

Ўзбекистон Республикаси Олий ва
ўрта махсус таълим вазирлиги
Алишер Навоий номидаги Тошкент давлат
ўзбек тили ва адабиёти университети

«АЛИШЕР НАВОИЙ ВА ХХІ АСР»

мавзуидаги халқаро илмий-назарий
анжумани материаллари

гапи келтирилади: “хулқ эътироздан воз кечишдир” (–Б.216). Тасаввуф – хулқ, хулқ эса – эътироздан, қаршилиқдан, инкордан, раддиядан воз кечиш, булар эзгуликнинг энг чўққиси ҳисобланади. Сўфийлардан Абу Жаъфар Ҳаддод (–Б. 118) ва Абу Абдуллоҳ Барқий (–Б.119) ҳам тасаввуф таърифида бир хил муштарак фикр билдирган: “...тасаввуф, анинг асаридурки, ерда гоҳ ошкора килур ва гоҳ пинҳон” (–Б.119). Демак, тасаввуф ўзининг таъсир доираси билан замон ва заминда ошкор – очикча, гоҳ эса пинҳон – яширин тарзда намоён бўлар экан. Тасаввуф аслида номақбул ишларни ошкор айлайди, мақбул ишларни тарғиб қилади, сирларни сир сақлайди, хулоса чиқариш кишиларнинг ўзига ҳавола этилади. Тасаввуф ошкорга – ошкор, пинҳонга – пинҳон, ўз даврининг ҳам ошкори ва ҳам пинҳонлиги унда тажассус топган. Бошқа бир сўфий Абубакр Дукқий (вафоти 970): “офият тасаввуф билан бўлмас” (–Б.133) деб, тасаввуфга ўзгача шарҳ беради ва унинг сирларини очишга интилади. Офият–тинчлик, осудалик, соғлик, соғайиш, аҳли офият – покиза ва соф кишилар, ана шуларга эришмоқ тасаввуф билан рўёбга чиқмас экан. Афтидан тасаввуф ва покизалиқдаги номувофиқлик орқали сўфийликнинг қаландарлик ҳамда дарवेशлик сулуқотлари га зимдан ишора қилинмоқда. Абубакр Дукқийга оид хабарларнинг давомида “офиятилма, яъни шариатда” (–Б. 113) дейилиб, софликнинг илмдан озукланишига, илмнинг шариат бағрида камол топишига очикча таъкид берилмоқда.

ФОЙДАЛАНИЛГАН АДАБИЁТЛАР:

1. Комилов Нажмиддин. *Тасаввуф*. –Тошкент: *Movuroin* nashr. 2009.
2. Навоий Алишер. *Мукаммал асарлар тўплами*. 20 томлик. 17-том. *Насоиймул-муҳаббат*. Нашрга тайёрловчилар: С.Ғаниева, М.Мирзааҳмедова. –Тошкент: *Фан*, 2001.
3. Сирожиддинов Ш. *Ўзбек мумтоз адабиётининг фалсафий сарчашмалари*. –Тошкент: *Янги аср авлоди*, 2011.
4. Ҳаққул Иброҳим. *Навоийга қайтиш*. –Тошкент: *Фан*, 2007.

THE PECULARITIES OF TRANSLATING GHASAL STANAS INTO ENGLISH LANGUAGE

BUMATOVA Aidakhon
TSUULL
(Ўзбекистон)

The issue of poetry translatability has a long history of discussions held by many scholars. Linguists and translators have been concerned with this problem and each of them has given logical assumptions to prove their points of view. For instance, Roman Jakobson states that “Poetry by definition is untranslatable and it requires creative transposition” (1966:238). Dryden on the other hand maintains poetry can be translated on condition that the translator is a poet himself (Frost, 1969: 72). Nevertheless, the hardships of the lyric translation can be summed up in the quote by prominent poet Percy Bysshe Shelley: “It were as wise to cast a violet into a crucible that you might discover the formal principle of its color and odor, as to seek to transfuse from one language into another the creations of a poet. The plant must spring again from its seed, or it will bear no flower”.

Uzbek classical literature with its immense masterpieces of a poetic thought and style is still not widely known to the world. This is the issue that has to be dealt with as soon as possible. So far, most translations from the Uzbek language were done through a meta-language, Russian. Any translation is a transformation of the form and meaning of the original. That’s why the world had to read not the translation from Uzbek classical literature but its translation to Russian. The issue made a great progress in the years of independence, when the direct translations from Uzbek into English came into the trend. There were two poetry translation books published, namely “Ummondandurlar. Ghazallar, hikmatlarvaruboiylardannamunalar” (“Pearls from the ocean. Samples from ghazals, wise sayings and rubaiyat”) by several

authors in English and German and "Selected gazels of Navoiy (in the Uzbek and English languages)" by D. Sultanov in 2000 and 2015 respectively. A year after, an American poet and translator Dennis Day translated and published in Cervena Barva Press his first translation book from the Uzbek classical literature, from great Navoiy to be more precise, and called it "Twenty-One-Ghazals". According to the book, all the translations were done from Uzbek. In the acknowledgement part of his book, Dennis Day mentions his own daughter, Jen, who prepares the rough prose translations for him, for her assistance. As the book has been rendered directly from the source language, we consider it to be very useful in bringing the Uzbek classical poetry around the world, and exploring the styles and methods of the translation that has been done by a native speaker poet.

The original ghazal is included both in "Badoiulbidoya" (1987:67) and "Gharoyib us-sighar" collections. The seven stanzas of the ghazal are written in "Ramalimusammanimahzuf: " - È - - / - È - - / - È - - " (foilotun/ foilotun/ foilotun/ foilon). "Gulistondin, shakkaristondin, afghondin, jonondin, shabistondin, sultondin" are rhyming words, while "judo" is a radif. The rhyming "a-a; b-a; c-a; d-a; e-a; f-a; g-a"; Ghazal is devoted to love with some philosophical metaphors of

1- stanza:

*Ne navo soz aylagay bulbul gulistondin judo,
Aylamas tooti takallum shakkaristondin judo.*

The general meaning of the couplet is the following: "A nightingale would never sing if it is far from its flower garden. A parrot would never talk if it is not given the sweet treating." The nightingale and parrot are traditional images in Turkic classical poetry. Nightingales, who live in the wild, are famous for their sweet singing. However, they do not sing in captivity, far from the flowers and gardens. The parrots, on the other hand, are used to live in the houses of people, especially in the household of rich ones, where they are fed with sweets and fruits. So, once they are cut off the sweets, they stop talking. The idea was also given in a well-known work of Navoi "Lisonut-tayr" ("Language of the birds") of Navoi where the parrot refuses to go with the other birds in search of Semurgh, and claims that parrots cannot bear living without the sweets they are given by beautiful mistresses.

Translation of D. Sultanova (2015:19):

Would a nightingale sing in tune if from its dale blooming it parts?
Would a parrot chirp merry notes if from its sweetly treating parts?

First of all, analyzing the equivalence on the linguistic level, it should be noted that the idea of talking parrot of the original is shifted to chirping merry notes in the translation. Secondly, on the grammatical point, the sequence of tenses in the conditional sentence construction is not used properly. One could argue, of course, that grammar is not an ultimate in the poetic translation, as long as the mood and idea is transformed correctly. Nevertheless, a good grammar is there for a reason. The reader, who sees a proper grammar in the text, will understand it much easier.

Translation from "P.O." (2000:123):

Of what can the nightingale sing if he is deprived of his flower garden?
The parrot too ceases to talk if he is deprived of his sweet tongued mate.

The original says that the parrot stops talking without sweets, whereas the translator adds a new image of sweet tongued mate. Thus, the translator introduces the idea that is not given in the original. "Shakkariston" is literally translated as the place where the sugar is kept. So, it is a place not a living being. Under the term, Navoi means the place where the parrot is fed with sweets. Moreover, the word "shakkariston" is used as the rhyme for the word "guliston".

Translation of D. Daly (2016:27):

*Does a nightingale sing when deprived, when apart
From wildflowers? Or parrots go mute if apart?*

This translation is the shortest of all three and moreover, this short style is continued throughout the whole translation. Obviously, this is a very good example of a poetry translation when you read the text and enjoy the musical qualities. However, the same misunderstanding that occurred in the previous translation can be seen here, that is the imagery of parrots being apart from each other rather than the "shakkariston".

Nothing makes literature as well-known to the world as its renderings into foreign languages. On this light, it is reasonable to pen down that poetic translation is a great of importance in the process of acqui-

sition of the national poetry to the globe. The article will discuss the current issues of ghazal translations. Investigating the progress of ghazal, we have found out that despite of its pure oriental origination, ghazal is a novel poetic genre neither for Europe nor for the New World. There are very good composed ghazals in English, German, French, Hebrew and Spanish. A beautiful tradition of ghazal, started in the Near East and was introduced to Europe through the translations of works of Saadi Shirazi's "Gulistan" and "Bustan" made by the traveler and scholar Adam Olearius (1671 A.D.) in the seventeenth century. In this article, I should like to make a comparative analysis of three translations of famous ghazal's matlaa – initial stanza of Mir Alisher Navoi's – "Qaroko'zum" into the English language.

*Qaro ko'zum kelu mardum lug'emdi fan qilg'il,
Ko'zum qarosida mardum kibi vatan qilg'il (A.Navoi) [333; 4].
My dark eye come and humanity now learn,
In black of my eyes (iris) as a pupil, make your home.*

"Qaro ko'zum" – literally means "my black eye", but the meaning of "my dark eyed person, friend, beloved" is clear from the context. Navoi did not write a ghazal about his own eyes, of course, the author uses synecdoche – he says "eye" meaning "person"; therefore, "qaroko'zum" will be rendered as "my dark/black eyed" in the article. In Sufi symbolism, eye represents a perfect human – it sees only others and never sees itself. [178 ; 2]. Eye is a wonderful and complex organ according to its physiology as well. It is consisted of about twenty parts that allow us to see the world around. Navoi, as a great thinker with encyclopedic knowledge uses this fact in his ghazal. The color of the human eye is set by the iris – a flat, colored, ring-shaped membrane behind the cornea of the eye, with an adjustable circular opening (pupil) in the center. So pupil is in the center of an iris. Navoi uses both of the terms: "ko'zum qarosi" ("iris, my black eye") and "mardum" ("pupil").

The general meaning of the couplet is: "My dark eyed (beautiful) one, come to me and show me kindness, learn humanness and be faithful to me; you are as dear as the apples of my eyes to me, your place is in my pupils". Being apart from a dear person brings sadness and grief to the heart. That longing is gone only when the beloved person is around. So, the poet asks to come to see him. The beloved is compared to the pupil that has a very deep symbolic meaning: without one, a person cannot see. The poet is not blind; however, without his friend, he is not able to see anything else.

The ghazal consists of eight couplets. According to academic Alibek Rustamov ghazal is devoted to a friend [; 7]. The first two lines are considered as a "shokh-bayt" or "husnimatlaa" – the initial stanza with a great ornamentation in it. According to literature critic Vahob Rahmonov, it consists of at least ten types of oriental classic poetic devices as "apostrophe", "epithet", "tardiaks", "tajnis", "iyhom", "ishtiqoq", "tashbih", "amr" and "muraddaf" [; 5]. We have counted the following poetic devices in these two lines:

1. **Apostrophe** – rhetoric appeal or address; in the English language we can compare it to the interjection. The words or phrases that are aimed to appealing to either god, beloved or nature. In the ghazal, it is represented by the phrase "Qaroko'zum" ("My dark eyed").

2. **Epithet** – an adjective or phrase expressing a quality or attribute regarded as characteristic of the person or thing. It is represented by the word "Qaro" ("dark"); in the oriental court poetry, the epithet "dark" is very common. In addition to the dark eyes, the beloved beauty usually has dark eyebrows as well. The word "dark" toward a woman's hair, eyes and eyebrows, together with her fair skin, associates with her absolute beauty, whereas the same word used for the male usually describes his being ultimately fortuneless and miserable in front of his beloved. There are features of using the words "dark", "black" or even "raven black" in the English poetry.

3. **Synecdoche** is a type of metaphor where a part of an item stands for the whole or the whole stands for the part. "Qaroko'zum" ("My dark eyed") in this context stands for the person in a whole.

4. **Alliteration** – the usage of the same consonants in a line in order to provide certain poetic sounding. For instance, *qaro, qilg'il, qarosida, qilg'il; ko'zum, kel-u, ko'zum;*

5. **Iyhom** – the literal meaning is "to cause someone doubt"; it is the art of creating extra meanings or sub-contexts. Reading a line, we can perceive the first or literal meaning of it; however, after a while, the reader is able to understand the additional meaning of the line that is built on the previous art of tajnis using homonyms in a line. According to this, "Qaroko'zum" can be read either:

a) My black eyed beauty – a beautiful girl with black eyes;

or

b) My dear person – a person who is very dear to me, despite the eye-color;

6. Ishqiqoq – the usage in the line derivatives of the word. On this line, the poet uses the words “mardum” and “mardumlig”.

7. Tashbih – in English literature it is called simile. The word “kibi” from the second line can be translated into English with “as” or “like”. “Mardumkibi” in the second line corresponds to the likeness to both “person” and “pupil”;

8. Amr – the usage of the imperative mood in a sentence. It is very common in oriental poetry. Here the poet rouses the friend to an action. In the framework of the stanza, the words “kelu” and “qilg’il” can be shown as an example to this.

9. Tardiaks – “vice versa” repeating of the word combinations in the line. Here, the structure “Qaro-ko’zum” (“My dark eyed”) from the first line is repeated as “Ko’zumqarosida” (“In black (dark) of my eyes”) in the second line. Though, involving only two words, it does not create tautology. In the first line, as we have seen above, we read the address to the beloved woman, while the second line creates the meaning of “in the iris of my eye”.

10. Muraddaf – according to the structure, a traditional ghazal may be of two rhyming forms. Muraddaf is the form where the whole ghazal ends with the same word – radif. Here, the radif is the word “qilg’il” (“make”).

11. Tanosub – the usage of the words with close meanings through the lines. The words – “ko’z, mardum, mardumug’, qaro” (“eye, pupil, person, humanity, dark”) are all express close meanings;

12. Tajnis – the usage of the homonyms in the lines. The meanings of the word “mardum” are: 1) pupil of an eye; 2) person, man;

The translation of D. Sultanova contains a pretty much of the transformation of both form and the meaning of the original stanza. It starts with the verb and after comes the subject – forming inversion in the line. One should pay attention that “my dark eye” of the original has turned into “my dark eyed beauty” in translation. The translator was able to understand the initial idea of the greatest poet; he would never write a devotion to his own eye, of course:

Come, my dark eyed beauty that dwelling thy endeared land make,
Dwell in the pupil of my eye black, of it your Homeland make.

(D. Sultanova) [20; 6]

Apostrophe, epithet and synecdoche are well recreated. However, the first line of this translation lacks the fervent supplications of showing kindness and humanness, creating instead new image of “dwelling her endeared land to make”. It is not clear from the very first read what dwelling the poet may be talking about in the first line. The translator may be using it for adequate rendering of eastern poetic device – ish-tiqoq – using derivatives, but instead of “mardum” and “mardumlig” of the original she uses “dwelling” and “dwell” in the translation. One of the obstacles on the way of the creation of the equivalent translation of poetry is its form. What can be given as comments or explanations in simple narratives like stories or novels, unfortunately, do not work perfectly the same with the poems. In case of working with classical poetry, except from the form as a whole, we deal with the archaic or historic language that is not clear to modern people.

Nevertheless, this translation is the only one that recreates eastern poetic device tardiaks: “my dark eyed” of the first line is changed with – “my eye black” in the second line. Apparently, the translator escapes from the usage of the repetition of “dark” and choses its synonym “black”. In the poetry, both adjectives are common to be used with the word “eye”. Another transformation of the meaning waits for us in the second line of the translation. Here, the simile “as a pupil” of the source text is omitted and replaced to “in the pupil”. Translator found impossible the recreation of the wordplay on the basis of two meanings of the word “mardum” in the English translation, that is why, instead of tajnis in the second line, we see the translation-comment “of it your”. On the issue of the rhyming scheme, the translator succeeded in the recreation of radif – “make”, so “muraddif” was rendered into the TL.

Spelling and accuracy is critical in publishing of a translated piece of poetry. For instance, the words “kidness” and “weawe” that even do not exist in the English language, obviously appeared in the process of publication of the book “Ummondandurlar” (“Pearls from the ocean”); we would consider them “kindness” and “weave” respectively.

Come my dark eyed one come and show your kindness, / (*kindness*)
Weave a nest for yourself, in the depth of my pupils. / (*weave*)

(K. Ma'murov/L.Kmetyuk) [114; 4]

This translation starts with the inversion as well; "my dark eye" of the original is translated as "my dark eyed one" – the initial idea of the poet was correctly interpreted. The first line contains the repetition of the verb "come" – we believe the aim of the translators were to keep rhythm of the line. The meaning of the rest line is perfectly transferred into the English language. The second line is a general summary of the main message of the original. Unfortunately, keeping the idea, the translators were not able to recreate the formal beauty of the ST. For instance, we counted three poetic devices here: *tardi-aks*, *tajnis* and *simile*; none of them were kept, unfortunately. Instead, we have the construction of "weave a nest". There is a phrase "to build a nest" in the English language. "Weaving" is more the action of the spiders rather than birds; "nest" is a house for birds not spiders. "In the depth of my pupils" – is another phrase that was transformed. A "pupil" becomes "pupils", a new image of "depth of pupils" appeared. The phrase sounds rather artificial as pupils do not have depth. Moreover, poet never mentioned about "depth of pupils" as well. The original line contained a simile together with *tajnis* (the usage of homonyms) where a person's living in a house was compared to pupil's being in the center of an iris, i.e. "be around, let me see you all the time".

There is a similarity between the previous translation and translation of the initial stanza by D.Daly. The translator uses the phrases "dark-eyed one" and "depth of my pupils":

Dark-eyed one come, show the nature of your kind soul,
Probe into the depth of my pupils, seek my soul. (D.Daly)

Omitting the possessive pronoun "my" translator keeps the word order of the original. However, he changes the verb into "probe into" – "asking questions or trying to discover facts about something, investigating"; the translator seems to urge the beloved to inquiry his eyes – that are windows of the soul in order to search for it. Apparently, the aim of the translator was to keep some formal balance using "show ... your kind soul" in the first and "seek my soul" in the second lines. However, it did have the consequences for the meaning of the whole stanza. It reads much as the short synopsis of personal interpretation of the lines, rather than a translation. Usually, the beloved is described as unfair and heartless. Therefore, asking for showing the nature of a kind soul does not correspond to the classical image of the beloved. In TT the translator wants her to look deep in his eyes, and seek his soul, while in ST the poet does not mention his own soul. From the devices we counted above, only apostrophe and epithet are kept in the translation.

REFERENCES:

1. Is'hoqov, Y. "So'zsan'atiso'zliligi" ("The art of the word's art"); publishing house "Uzbekistan", Tashkent – 2014;
2. Komilov, N. "Ma'nolarolamigasafar" ("A journey to the world of meanings")
3. Navo'i, Alisher. Collection of completed works in XX volumes. Volume I. Badoyeulbidoyapublishing house "Fan" Tashkent – 1987;
4. Navo'i, A. "Ummondandurlar: G'azallar, hikmatlarvaruboiylardannamunalar. O'zbek, nemisva-ingliztillarida." ("Pearls from the ocean. Samples from gazels, wise sayings and rubaiys"); publishing house "Sharq" Tashkent – 2000;
5. Rahmonov, V. "Mumtozso'zsehri" ("The magic of a classic word"); publishing house "Uzbekistan", Tashkent – 2015;
6. Sultanova, D. "Selected gazels of Navoiy (in the uzbek and English languages)"; publishing house "Navruz", Tashkent – 2015;
7. Valikhodjaye, B. "Mumtozsiymolar" ("Representatives of classic literature") Volume I. Tashkent – 2002.

ТЕЗИСЛАР

АДАБИЁТШУНОСЛИК

АБДУЛЛАЕВ Муҳаммаджон. Навоийга замондош хаттотлар.....	368
✓ АБДУМАННАПОВА Шоҳсанам. Алишер Навоийнинг “Лайли ва Мажнун” достонида қофия ва мазмун уйғунлиги.....	370
✓ АБДУҚОДИРОВА Мадина. “Муҳокамат ул-луғатайн” ва “Сўз Латофати”.....	372
АБДУЛЛАЕВ Р., ИКРОМОВ И. Қўқон хонлигида Алишер Навоий асарларига муносабат.....	374
АБДУРАЗЗОҚОВА Шоира. “Тарихи анбиё ва ҳукамо”да тарихий воқеликни тасвирлаш тамойили..	376
АБДУЛЛАЕВА Дилдорахон. Икки ҳикоятнинг муштарак моҳияти.....	377
АБДУЛЛАЕВА Ноила. «Тарихи анбиё ва ҳукамо»да Одам алайҳиссалом образи.....	379
✓ АБДУРАҲМОНОВА Б., СОЛИЕВА О. Навоийга мухаммас.....	381
АБДУХАКИМОВА Юлдуз. Алишер Наваи и Муҳаммад Фузули: аналогия портрета Лейли.....	383
АБДИСАЛОМОВА Ш., АБДУРАҲМОНОВА М. Навоий ва замонамиз.....	385
АВАЗНАЗАРОВ Одилжон. “Садди Искандарий”да туш мотивининг ўрни.....	387
АЛИМУХАМЕДОВ Рихситилла. Талабаларга Навоий меросини ўқитиш масалалари.....	390
АМОНОВ Шермуҳаммад. Навоий ва Табибий: ижодий муштараклик.....	392
АМОНОВА Зилола. Алишер Навоий ижодида Мансур Ҳалложга муносабат.....	394
АРСЛОНОВ Абдимурод. Икки тилда яратилган бир мавзудаги дostonларда шакл ва мазмун уйғунлиги.....	396
АҲМЕДОВ Ҳошимжон. Адабий таълимда Алишер Навоий ҳасби ҳолини ўрганишнинг айрим жиҳатлари ҳақида.....	399
БАҲРИДДИНОВА Дилдора Ойбекнинг “Навоий” достони хусусида.....	401
БОЗОРОВА С., БОЗОРОВА И. “Маҳбуб ул-қулуб”даги айрим ҳикматлар талқини.....	402
БОЗОРОВА МУСЛИМА. “Насойим ул-муҳаббат”да тасаввуф зикри.....	404
ВУМАТОВА Aidakhon. The peculiarities of translating ghasal stanzas into english language.....	405
ДАВРОНОВА Шоҳсанам. “Озод” романи ва Алишер Навоий анъаналари.....	410
ЭРКИНОВ Афтондил. Алишер Навоий қўлёзмалари каталогини яратишнинг Туркия тажрибасидан.....	411
ЎРАЕВА Дармоний. Алишер Навоийнинг “Лайли ва Мажнун” достонида Мажнун навҳалари бадиияти.....	413
ЖАББОРОВА Матлуба. “Хамса” дostonларига Жамшид образи.....	414
ЖАББОРОВА Азиза. Навоийнинг орифона мулоҳазалари.....	416
ЖАЛИЛОВ Ж., БАЙМАТОВА Ф. Мир образ в поэме «Фархад и Ширин».....	418
ЖУМАЕВ Анвар. Навоийнинг одил шоҳ ахлоқиға муносабати.....	422
ЖЎРАЕВА Гулноза. Кичик мактаб ёшидаги болаларга Алишер Навоий ижодини ўргатиш усуллари.....	424
ЖУМАЕВА К. Алишер Навоий ва Ширвони Ҳоконий қасидалари тахлили.....	424
ЖУМАНИЯЗОВА Динара. Навоий ижодида ишора санъати.....	424
ЗАРИПОВА Дилфуза. “Агар огоҳсен, сен-шоҳсен...”.....	424
ИСМОИЛОВ Илёс. Алишер Навоийнинг “Садди Искандарий” достонида Искандар васиятининг талқини.....	43
КАРИМОВА Нафиса. “Насойим ул-муҳаббат ” асарида туш мавзуси.....	43
КЎҶЎКМЕНМЕТОҒЛУ Ömer. Türk Dil kurumu dergilerinde Alişir Nevâî.....	43
КЕЛДИЁРОВ А., МУРОДИЛЛАЕВА З. Алишер Навоий ғазалларининг вазни кўрсаткичли дастурини яратиш масалалари.....	43
МУХАМЕДЖАНОВА В.А. Наваи о прогрессивных тенденциях в истории человечества.....	43